Medicine in the Time of #metoo, Taking Stock and Next Steps

Our Lady of the Lake Regional Medical Center

Eva Mathews, MD MPH Lauren Mulligan, MD Rumneet Kullar, DO



1) Articulate the challenges for individuals and institutions in the identification and remediation of a culture of harassment.

2) Describe the effect of sexual harassment on physician wellness and burnout.

3) Discuss the cultural norms that allow for harassment to continue and that must be addressed.

4) Acknowledge the complexity for all parties in their attempts to "get this right" - female physicians, the institutions, the potential harassers.

5) Create a list of potential actions to support female physicians and promote change on interpersonal, departmental and institutional levels.



Learning Objectives

The authors have no conflicts of interest to report (other than all having been subjected to sexual bias and harassment in our careers)!



Sexual Harassment in Academics and Medicine

Review of the current literature





Direct and Indirect Harassment Experiences and Burnout among Academic Faculty in Japan

- Cross sectional study at a large private university in Japan which has a medical school and many other schools (pharmacy, law school, liberal arts, etc.)
- 330 faculty responded -- male and female
- Looked at: sexual harassment, gender harassment and academic harassment
- The prevalence of direct and indirect harassment was higher in women
- Women had higher rates of burnout if they experienced indirect harassment
 - Social support did not have a buffering effect as was observed in men

Direct harassment	Female, N	Female, %	Male, N	Male, %
Sexual	10	10.4%	11	5.2%
Gender	23	24%	20	9.3%
Academic	34	34%	52	23.4%

Masumi Takeuchi, Kyoko Nomura, Saki Horie, Hiroko Okinaga, Chithra R. Perumalswami, and Reshma Jagsi. Direct and Indirect Harassment Experiences and Burnout among Academic Faculty in Japan. The Tohoku Journal of Experimental Medicine, 2018, Volume 245, Issue 1, Pages 37-44, Released May 12, 2018, Online ISSN 1349-3329, Print ISSN 0040-8727, https://doi.org/10.1620/tjem.245.37, https://www.jstage.jst.go.jp/article/tjem/245/1/245_37/_article/-char/en

Survey on recent suicidal ideation among female university hospital physicians in Sweden and Italy (the HOUPE study): cross-sectional associations with work stressors

- Survey of 385 docs in Sweden and 126 in Italy
- 13.7% from Sweden and 14.3% from Italy reported suicidal thoughts in the last 12 months!
- Harassment at work increases risk of suicidal thoughts, OR 3.03 (1.48-6.23)
- Work meetings to discuss stressful situations reduced risk of suicidal thoughts, OR 0.21 (0.05-0.86)
- Suggest that meetings to discuss stressful work experiences should be more broadly implemented



AnnFridnerPhD[,] KarenBelkicMD, PhD[,] MassimoMariniMSc, DariaMinucciMD, PhD[,] LuigiPavanMD[,] KarinSchenck-GustafssonMD, PhD[,] Survey on recent suicidal ideation among female university hospital physicians in Sweden and Italy (the HOUPE study): cross-sectional associations with work stressors. Gender medicine, ISSN: 1550-8579, Vol: 6, Issue: 1, Page: 314-28. 2009

Self-Reported Depression and Suicide Attempts Among US Women Physicians



Elizabeth Blackwell, the first female physician in the U.S. Graduated first in her class in 1849

- N=4501, self-reports from US women physicians
- Women physicians RR of suicide was 2.5-5.7 higher compared to the general female population
- 3.7-4.5 higher compared to other female professionals
- 1.5% in this study reported a suicide attempt (this is low compared to other literature) and 19.4% reported a h/o depression
- Having a h/o severe harassment in a medical setting had increased rates of reporting a suicide attempt or depression
- Depression was more frequently reported by psychiatrists with a h/o sexual abuse (didn't ask the setting)
 - RR of 2.9 for a suicide attempt, and 4.6 for depression

National Academies of Science, Engineering and Medicine Report on Sexual Harassment, 2018

- Consensus study report
- Evidence based
- Peer reviewed
- Methods: series of workshops and "deep study" of the literature
- 2 year study, 313 page report



National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. 2018. Sexual Harassment of Women: Climate, Culture, and Consequences in Academic Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. https://doi.org/10.17226/24994.

National Academies of Science, Engineering and Medicine Report on Sexual Harassment, 2018



Sexual harassment consists of three types of behavior • Sexual Coercion

- Unwanted sexual attention
- Gender Harassment

National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. 2018. *Sexual Harassment of Women: Climate, Culture, and Consequences in Academic Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine*. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. https://doi.org/10.17226/24994.



It's Not Getting Better, Yet

Sexual harassment has not declined in the past 30 years

- Women experience sexual harassment more often than men
- <u>Awareness</u> of what defines sexual harassment has greatly improved since 1980
- Sexual Harassment can be either direct or ambient
 - Harmful in both cases
- Gender harassment is by far the most common type of sexual harassment



• Behaviors that communicate that women do not belong or merit respect

National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. 2018. *Sexual Harassment of Women: Climate, Culture, and Consequences in Academic Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine*. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. https://doi.org/10.17226/24994.

Preliminary Research, Let's Do More!



• Women of color

- Experience more sexual harassment that white women
- They often experience racial harassment, as well
- Research without women of color is incomplete
- Sexual and Gender-minority people (i.e. gay, lesbian, transgender)
 - Experience more sexual harassment that heterosexual women
 - Research that without these groups is also incomplete

National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. 2018. Sexual Harassment of Women: Climate, Culture, and Consequences in Academic Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. https://doi.org/10.17226/24994.

What Can We Do?

Two biggest factors associated with highest rates of sexual harassment

- Male-dominated gender ratios and leadership
- Organizational Climate



Sexual Harassment in Medicine



- Residencies were described as "breeding grounds for abusive behavior by superiors"
- Perhaps there is so much abuse of all kinds that sexual harassment is seen as part of that continuum
- Women perceived sexual harassment to be worse in academic medicine vs. community settings
- Women physicians are also harassed by patients and their families
- In academia: >50% of women faculty and 25-50% of students encounter or experience sexual harassment

National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. 2018. Sexual Harassment of Women: Climate, Culture, and Consequences in Academic Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. https://doi.org/10.17226/24994.

Factors That Make Harassment Worse

- The greater the frequency, intensity and duration of sexual harassment, the more women report depression, stress and anxiety
- Sexual harassment often leads women to reduced productivity at work and women thinking of or actually leaving their job or even field of work
- The more power the perpetrator has over the target, the greater the impact on the victim



National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. 2018. Sexual Harassment of Women: Climate, Culture, and Consequences in Academic Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. https://doi.org/10.17226/24994.

15 Recommendations from National Academies of Science, Engineering and Medicine

- 1. Creative diverse, inclusive and respectful environments
- 2. Address the most common form of sexual harassment: gender harassment
- 3. Move beyond legal compliance to address culture and climate
- 4. Improve transparency and accountability
- 5. Defuse the hierarchical and dependent relationship between faculty and trainees

15 Recommendations from National Academies of Science, Engineering and Medicine

- 6. Provide support for the targeted individual
- 7. Strive for strong and diverse leadership
- 8. Measure progress
- 9. Incentivize change

10. Encourage involvement of professional societies and other organizations

National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. 2018. Sexual Harassment of Women: Climate, Culture, and Consequences in Academic Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. https://doi.org/10.17226/24994. 15 Recommendations from National Academies of Science, Engineering and Medicine

- **11. Initiate legislative action**
- 12. Address the failures to meaningfully enforce Title VII's prohibition on sex discrimination
- 13. Increase federal agency action and collaboration
- 14. Conduct necessary research

15. Make the entire academic community responsible for reducing and preventing sexual harassment

National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. 2018. Sexual Harassment of Women: Climate, Culture, and Consequences in Academic Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. https://doi.org/10.17226/24994. Survey of Louisiana Female Physicians on burnout and sexual harassment/bias





Research questions

• Is there an association between female physician burnout and sexual harassment and/or sexual bias?

• Was burnout related to how appropriately claims of sexual harassment were handled?



Methods

3,795 female

physicians

with active

licenses

17,352 licensed physicians in Louisiana

> Removed all out of state addresses. Attempted to assign gender

1,000 female physicians randomly chosen for participation in study

> 30 removed for variety of reasons Postcards x 2 sent

Emails x 3 sent to anyone whose email was available 138 responses on Survey Monkey

9 removed for
being retired,
not answering
questions,
reporting being
out of state, or
duplicate
entries



Demographics of participants Response rate 129/970= 13.2%



Physicians from 23 specialties responded to the survey

Burnout: I feel burned out from my work



Burnout: I have become more callous toward people since I took this job.



Sexism

- 74% of respondents had been mistaken for a non-physician provider "often" or "very often" in their careers <u>by colleagues</u>
- 90% of respondents had been mistaken for a non-physician provider "often" or "very often" in their careers <u>by patients and families</u>



Sexual Harassment related to colleagues

- 92% of participants reported at least one incident of unwanted discussion of sexual matters (15% reported it had occurred "often" or "very often")
- 74% reported at least one incident of rude/offensive sexual remarks from colleagues (10% reported it had occurred "often" or "very often")
- 65% reported at least one incident of unwanted sexual attention from colleagues (5% reported it had occurred "often" or "very often")

Sexual Harassment from patients or families

69 of 129 (53%) reported instances of sexual harassment from patients or their families



Referring to a specific incident of sexual harassment

- 49 (38%) said one particular incident stood out to them. (mean years since incident was 14.21, range 0-38 years)
 - 33 (66%) said they did not report it
- Of the 38 reported <u>incidents</u>
 - 22 (59%) said that none of the reported incidents were handled appropriately
 - 6 (16%) said some of the incidents were handled appropriately
 - 9 (24%) said all of the incidents were handled appropriately
- 18 occurred after 2000, 15 occurred prior to 2000
 - 13 occurred after 2010!
- The average time from medical school graduation that these incidents took place was -1.3 years



Burnout correlated with

- Unwanted sexual discussion from patients (*r*= 0.309, p=0.010)
- Being mistaken for non-physician by colleagues (*r*=0.202, p= 0.022)
- Sexist remarks from colleagues (*r*=0.196, p=0.27)
- Mistreatment from colleagues due to sex (*r*=0.191, p=0.030)





More results...

- Colleague sexism and sexual harassment, patient sexism and sexual harassment are all correlated (*r* ranges from 0.483 to 0.650, p= 0.001)
- No correlation between burnout and how incidents of reported harassment were handled



More results...

- The level of work support a female physician perceives is inversely correlated with colleague sexism (*r*= -0.298, p=0.001) and colleague sexual harassment (*r*= -0.303, p=0.000)
- The level of personal support a female physician perceives is inversely correlated with burnout (*r*=-0.200, p=0.023)



Conclusions

- In our study, burnout was correlated with colleague sexism!
 - Bias and harassment– from patients and colleagues-happens to the same people.
 - Sexual harassment was most commonly reported as occurring during the medical education period.
 - Bias continues throughout medical careers.



How has the #metoo movement affected **medicine**?





How can we promote cultural changes that reduce sexual harassment/bias in **medicine**?





Where does the responsibility for change lie?







• What are the challenges for individuals and institutions in the remediation of the culture of harassment?





SPECIAL THANKS

- Drs. Kathleen Crapanzano and Carine Nzodom for their work on the survey and our resulting paper
- LSUHSC BR supporters: Rebecca Horn PhD, Thanh Le, and Sarah Lauve for their work on the survey

For questions, comments or concerns: Eva.Mathews@fmolhs.org

1.